



Endnotes & Citations

diversitydatakids.org Head Start Policy Equity Assessment: Research Evidence

- ⁶⁴ Rigorous studies showing evidence of short or long-term Head Start effectiveness include the Head Start Impact Study, the Head Start Research-Based, Developmentally Informed (REDI) interventions and several non-experimental Head Start studies such as Garces, E., Thomas, D., & Currie, J. (2000). *Longer term effects of Head Start* (NBER Working Paper No. 8054). Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research. Retrieved from <http://www.nber.org/papers/w8054>; and Ludwig, J. & Phillips, D.A. (2008). Long-term effects of Head Start on low-income children. *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences*, 1136, 257–268. doi: 10.1196/annals.1425.005. Retrieved from <http://home.uchicago.edu/~ludwigj/papers/NYAS-LudwigPhillips-HeadStart-2008.pdf>.
- ⁶⁵ *Advisory Committee on Head Start Research and Evaluation: Final report*. (2012). U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Retrieved from http://www.acf.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/opre/eval_final.pdf.
- ⁶⁶ Puma, M., Bell, S., Cook, R., Heid, C., Broene, P., Jenkins, F., ..., Downer, J. (2012). *Third grade follow-up to the Head Start Impact Study final report*. (OPRE Report 2012-45). Washington, DC: Office of Planning, Research and Evaluation, Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Retrieved from http://www.acf.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/opre/head_start_report.pdf.
- ⁶⁷ For more information, see [Targeting Vulnerable Populations: Responding to the Needs of American Indian and Alaska Native Families](#); [Targeting Vulnerable Populations: Responding to the Needs of Migrant and Seasonal Worker Families](#); [Dual Language Learners in Head Start](#); and [Changes in Head Start Eligibility Requirements Over Time: Broadening the Criteria for a More Inclusive Program](#).
- ⁶⁸ For more information, see [Head Start’s Capacity to Serve Eligible Low-Income Children and Head Start Access and Participation: Variation by Geography, Race and Ethnicity](#).
- ⁶⁹ For more information, see [Head Start Program Variation: Variation in Child Experiences and Dosage to Head Start](#); and Barnett, S., Carolan, M. & Johns, D. (2013). *Equity and excellence: African-American children’s access to quality preschool*. National Institute for Early Education Research (NIEER). New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University. Retrieved from http://nieer.org/sites/nieer/files/Equity%20and%20Excellence%20African-American%20Children%E2%80%99s%20Access%20to%20Quality%20Preschool_0.pdf.
- ⁷⁰ Puma, M., Bell, S., Cook, R., & Heid, C. (2010). *Head Start Impact Study: Final report*. Washington, DC: Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Retrieved from http://www.acf.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/opre/hs_impact_study_final.pdf; Pianta, R.C., Barnett, W.S., Burchinal, M., & Thornburg, K.R. (2009). The Effects of Preschool Education: What We Know, How Public Policy Is or Is Not Aligned With the Evidence Base, and What We Need to Know. *Psychological Science*, 10(2), 49–88.
- ⁷¹ At Head Start entry, Dual Language Learners lag behind children from monolingual English homes in some developmental areas, and all children lag behind their peers in the population in many areas (*Report to Congress on Dual Language Learners in Head Start and Early Head Start programs*. (2013). Washington, D.C.: Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Retrieved from <http://www.acf.hhs.gov/programs/opre/resource/report-to-congress-on-dual-language-learners-in-head-start-and-early-head>).
- ⁷² The Advisory Committee on Head Start Research and Evaluation reviewed the literature on preschool program

diversitydatakids.org

data for a diverse and equitable future



effectiveness and reported that “early childhood programs including Head Start can reduce achievement disparity typically by 20 to 50 percent” (*Advisory Committee on Head Start research and evaluation: Final report* (2012). U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Retrieved from http://www.acf.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/opre/eval_final.pdf). In addition, Pianta et al. reviewed data from the Head Start Impact Study and calculated that the magnitude of average Head Start impacts on cognitive outcomes would close up to 10% to 20% of the achievement gap. The authors imply that effects of much greater magnitude are needed to successfully eliminate school readiness gaps, but also acknowledge that the average effect detected in the Head Start Impact Study was captured across significant variation in participants and program implementation (Pianta, R.C., Barnett, W.S., Burchinal, M., & Thornburg, K.R. (2009). *The Effects of Preschool Education: What We Know, How Public Policy Is or Is Not Aligned With the Evidence Base, and What We Need to Know. Psychological Science, 10(2), 49–88*).

- ⁷³ Bitler, Hoynes and Domina (2013) found larger cognitive gains from Head Start in children with low pre-academic skills at baseline (Bitler, M.P., Hoynes, H.W., & Domina, T. (2013). *Experimental Evidence on distributional effects of Head Start*. Retrieved from http://www.utexas.edu/cola/_files/ms37643/bdh-hsis-paper-11-21-13.pdf).
- ⁷⁴ Throughout the Research Evidence section of the diversitydatakids.org Head Start policy equity assessment, the term ‘impact’ refers to the difference in program outcomes between a treatment group offered the program and a control group not offered the program, in which membership in the treatment and control groups was determined by random assignment. In other words, this section focuses on studies with an **experimental study design**, also known as impact evaluations or randomized control trials (RCTs).
- ⁷⁵ Morris, P., Connors, M.C., McCoy, D.C., Yoshikawa, H., & Aber, J. L. (2013). *Panel paper: Do Head Start impacts vary by neighborhood context? A study of the Secondary Analysis of Variation in Impacts Head Start Center*. Washington, D.C.: APPAM Annual Fall Research Conference. Retrieved from <https://appam.confex.com/appam/2013/webprogram/Paper7218.html>.
- ⁷⁶ An implementation study did not form part of any of the original Head Start Impact Study reports. However, program implementation will be assessed in a new study: *Moderators, mechanisms, methods, and measurement in the Head Start Impact Study: Informing Head Start of the future*, by the Secondary Analysis of Variation in Impacts of Head Start center (Secondary Analysis of Variation in Impacts of Head Start center. (n.d.). Institute of Human Development and Social Change, Steinhardt School of Culture, Education, and Human Development, New York University. Retrieved from <http://steinhardt.nyu.edu/ihdsc/research/headstart/>; Research Center to Support Secondary Analyses of Head Start Impact Study Data, Grantees 2011-2013. (n.d.). Retrieved from http://www.acf.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/opre/research_center_to_support_secondary_analyses_of_head_start_impact.pdf).
- ⁷⁷ A currently ongoing study, the *Head Start Health Managers Descriptive Study* (HSHMDS), is a descriptive analysis aimed at providing “a snapshot of health-related activities and programming within Head Start (HS) and Early Head Start (EHS) programs.” A report is planned for release in mid-2014 (*Head Start Health Managers Descriptive Study* (HSHMDS). Rand Health. Retrieved from <http://www.rand.org/health/projects/head-start.html>).
- ⁷⁸ For more information see Hsueh, J. & Farrell, M.E. (2012). *Enhanced Early Head Start with employment services: 42-month impacts from the Kansas and Missouri sites of the Enhanced Services for the Hard-to-Employ Demonstration and Evaluation Project* (OPRE Report 2012-05). New York, NY: MDRC. Retrieved from http://www.acf.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/opre/kansas_missouri.pdf.

diversitydatakids.org

data for a diverse and equitable future



- ⁷⁹ The many studies and surveys of Head Start programs and participants constitute a data infrastructure that contains much of the information needed to examine differential effects (such as impacts by race/ethnicity). However, the currently collected information needs to be analyzed for differential impacts to a greater degree and further subgroup data collection (based on these systems) could be augmented.
- ⁸⁰ Ongoing or future studies and data sources of Migrant and Seasonal Head Start programs and participants include the *Design for Migrant and Seasonal Head Start survey: Final design report* (available at <http://www.acf.hhs.gov/programs/opre/resource/design-for-migrant-and-seasonal-head-start-survey-final-design-report>); the Migrant and Seasonal Head Start Supplement to the National Agricultural Worker Survey (available at <http://www.acf.hhs.gov/programs/opre/resource/2012-report-migrant-and-seasonal-head-start-supplement-to-the-national>) and the Head Start CARES project (information available at http://www.mdrc.org/project/head-start-cares-project#design_site_data_sources).
- ⁸¹ Puma, M., Bell, S., Cook, R., & Heid, C. (2010). *Head Start Impact Study: Final report*. Washington, DC: Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Retrieved from http://www.acf.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/opre/hs_impact_study_final.pdf.
- ⁸² Garces, E., Thomas, D., & Currie, J. (2000). *Longer term effects of Head Start* (NBER Working Paper No. 8054). Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research. Retrieved from <http://www.nber.org/papers/w8054>; Ludwig, J. & Phillips, D.A. (2008). Long-term effects of Head Start on low-income children. *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences*, 1136, 257–268. doi: 10.1196/annals.1425.005. Retrieved from <http://home.uchicago.edu/~ludwigj/papers/NYAS-LudwigPhillips-HeadStart-2008.pdf>; Child Care Aware of America. (2013). *Studies addressing Head Start impact*. Retrieved from http://www.naccra.org/sites/default/files/default_site_pages/2013/studiesaddressingheadstartimpact.pdf.
- ⁸³ United States General Accounting Office. (1997). *Head Start: Research provides little information on impact of current program* (GAO/HEHS-97-59). Retrieved from <http://www.gao.gov/archive/1997/he97059.pdf>.
- ⁸⁴ Klien, J. (2011). Time to ax public programs that don't yield results. *Time U.S.* Retrieved from <http://content.time.com/time/nation/article/0,8599,2081778,00.html>; Besharov, D.J. (2005). *Head Start's broken promise*. Washington, D.C.: American Enterprise Institute for Public Policy Research. Retrieved from http://www.aei.org/files/2005/10/25/20051025_3419153OTIBesharov_g.pdf.
- ⁸⁵ Ludwig, J. & Phillips, D.A. (2007). *The benefits and costs of Head Start* (NBER Working Paper 12973). Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research. Retrieved from <http://www.nber.org/papers/w12973>; Yoshikawa, H., Weiland, C., Brooks-Gunn, J. Burchinal, M.R., Espinosa, L.M., Gormley, W.T.,..., Zaslow, M.J. (2013). *Investing in our future: The evidence base on preschool education*. Ann Arbor, MI: Society for Research in Child Development. Retrieved from http://www.srca.org/sites/default/files/documents/washington/mb_2013_10_16_investing_in_children.pdf; Mattox, T. (2010). *Head Start: What do we know?* PPN Issue Briefs. Santa Monica, CA: Promising Practices Network. Retrieved from http://www.promisingpractices.net/briefs/briefs_headstart.asp.
- ⁸⁶ The Abecedarian program spent \$17,099 per child annually (in 2011 dollars, adjusted for inflation) and the HighScope/Perry Preschool Program spent \$11, 300 per child annually (in 2007 dollars). In contrast, Head Start federal spending was \$8,774 per child in the 2010-2011 program year (no adjustment). Sources: Abecedarian per child spending obtained from The Abecedarian Project. (2011). RAND Promising Practices. Retrieved from <http://www.promisingpractices.net/program.asp?programid=132#funding>. HighScope/Perry Preschool Program spending obtained from Perry Preschool Project. (n.d.) Coalition for Evidence Based Policy. Retrieved from <http://evidencebasedprograms.org/wordpress/1366/65-2/>. Head Start 2010-2011 spending obtained from Barnett, W.S., Carolan, M.E., Fitzgerald, J., & Squires, J.H. (2011). *The state of preschool 2011: State*

diversitydatakids.org

data for a diverse and equitable future



preschool yearbook (Appendix B: Head Start data, Notes). National Institute for Early Education Research (NIEER). New Jersey: Rutgers University. Retrieved from <http://nieer.org/publications/state-preschool-2011>

⁸⁷ United States Government Accounting Office. (1998). *Head Start: Challenges in monitoring program quality and demonstrating results*, Report to Congressional Requesters (GAO/HEHS-98-186). Retrieved from <http://www.gao.gov/archive/1998/he98186.pdf>.

⁸⁸ Durlak, J.A. & Dupree, E.P. (2008). Implementation matters: A review of research on the influence of implementation on program outcomes and the factors affecting implementation. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 41, 327–350.

⁸⁹ Sawhill, I.V. & Baron, J. (2010). We need a new start for Head Start. *Education Week*. Retrieved from <http://coalition4evidence.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/03/New-Start-for-Head-Start-Education-Week-2010.pdf>.